



HANDOUT WEEK 2 – PLAGIARISM

1) FRAUD

- Lance Armstrong
- **Tania Head – Alicia Esteve**

LISTENING TRACK - itunes

TranscriptGUY RAZ, HOST:

It's WEEKENDS on ALL THINGS CONSIDERED from NPR News. I'm Guy Raz. For many people for many years, this woman was the face and the voice of the survivors of September 11.

TANIA HEAD: I was on the south tower, and I lost my fiance that day.

RAZ: Tania Head's inspiring story of courage in the face of impossible devastation captivated millions of people, and not a word of it was true. Tania Head wasn't in the United States on September 11, 2001. Her name wasn't even Tania. Our book today is "The Woman Who Wasn't There: The True Story of an Incredible Deception." Authors Robin Gaby Fisher and Angelo Guglielmo join me now from our New York bureau. Welcome to both of you.

ANGELO GUGLIELMO: Thank you so much.

ROBIN GABY FISHER: Thank you, Guy.

RAZ: Angelo, let me start with you, because you were actually friends with this woman who called herself Tania Head. Who was she? How did you meet her?

GUGLIELMO: Tania and I met each other while we were volunteering at Ground Zero to give tours of the tribute center. We became friendly right away. You know, she came up to me in our training session and told me her story right there. And I immediately burst into tears. And...

RAZ: What did she tell you?

HEAD: Well, she told me that she was on the 78th floor when the plane actually came towards the towers. She said she could see it so close that she could feel the air being sucked out of her lungs. She had gotten thrown across the room. She

had passed out. She had seen incredible carnage surrounding her. Her arm got severed, and she miraculously made it to the doorway, and she was saved by Welles Remy Crowther. He was the man with the red bandana that was responsible for many people getting out of the towers alive. And he had died helping people escape.

GUGLIELMO: She got down to the sky lobby before the towers collapsed around her. She was thrown under a rig and woke up six days later as a John Doe in the hospital. So when you heard her story, I mean, you could just feel your heart ache.

RAZ: She said her fiance was in the other tower, and he was killed.

GUGLIELMO: Yes. She - actually, the first thing she thought about, she told me, was her husband Dave who was in the neighboring tower, and she actually counted floors from the top of the tower out the sky lobby window to see that he was the floor that had gotten hit.

RAZ: You decided shortly after you met her that you wanted to make a film?

GUGLIELMO: Yes. Well, I had made a 9/11 documentary about my volunteer experience at Ground Zero, and I wasn't really ready to make another movie again about that subject. I felt like I had said everything I had wanted to. Tania wanted me to make a film not only about her but about her work with the Survivors' Network. And there was a lot of back and forth. I didn't want to film...

RAZ: This is, we should say, an organization that she joined and became very prominent - prominent part of.

GUGLIELMO: Oh, yeah. The World Trade Center Survivors' Network had just gotten started at that point, and Tania had been instrumental in moving it forward and getting it noticed by basically everyone in the 9/11 community.

RAZ: Hey, Angelo, let me bring in your coauthor, Robin Gaby Fisher, into the conversation, because, Robin, what struck me in the book was this idea that before it all unraveled, before we discovered this is a massive hoax, a lot of people said - had said she helped them, she was really helping them, a lot of survivors and people who were traumatized by 9/11.

FISHER: Survivors continue to say that a great deal of their healing came from Tania helping them and from Tania helping get them recognized. They needed that validation. And no one was able to get that for them except for Tania.

RAZ: She said that she was working for Merrill Lynch and that's why she was at the World Trade Center. She also describes to people - and presumably to you, Angelo, as well - about how she encountered a dying man who asked her to give his ring.

GUGLIELMO: Oh, sure. She had said while she was crawling to the exit on the 78th floor and crawling over bodies - people who were burned from head to toe and people who were cut up - she came across a man who put into the palm of her hand his wedding ring and his business card and said, please get this to my wife. And it was the last moments of his life at that point, she said.

RAZ: And many people heard this story and were so taken with it, but nobody ever asked what was the name of that person.

FISHER: As everyone says, now looking back, there were so many questions they could have asked. But because of her story, even when they did have maybe little doubts, hints, they would immediately stop thinking about those things because how dare they question this woman who had been through so much. And after all, who would ever make up such a story?

RAZ: She carried out this hoax for almost six years. How did the story begin to unravel?

FISHER: The story began to unravel because The New York Times was looking for someone to profile for the sixth anniversary. And several people had told them that they should speak to Tania, because they never had. And so they began by trying to interview her, and she agreed, and then she cancelled the interviews. And they went ahead and did their normal background checking. And as they did their background checking, just - things started not to check out. And then when they called Merrill Lynch and Merrill Lynch said they had no employees by that name, the whole focus of the story, obviously, changed.

RAZ: What did they find out?

GUGLIELMO: Well, what they did find out was that her real name wasn't Tania Head at all, that she was actually not even in the United States on September 11, 2001, and that the likelihood of her ever meeting her husband, who was a real person that had died in the towers, was a complete impossibility.

RAZ: She was actually living in Spain at the time, right?

GUGLIELMO: That's correct. She was in Barcelona, Spain, in graduate school, and told no one of having been in the towers or having suffered any injuries.

RAZ: Angelo, when you saw this article in The New York Times, were you shocked, or by that point, did you already have your own suspicions?

GUGLIELMO: Well, we had known before The Times article came out, because what was going on behind the scenes was significant for all of us and eye-opening. You know, it went from, why is The Times harassing her? Why is this reporter repeatedly asking her questions around the anniversary when she doesn't want to talk to him, to why isn't she answering these questions? These - it's not like he's asking her questions that haven't been asked of her before. To, oh, oh, you know, and then all of a sudden, the truth just emerged.

RAZ: And her real - remind us what her real name was.

GUGLIELMO: It is Alicia Esteve Head.

RAZ: What happens at that point? Did she just disappear?

GUGLIELMO: I went up to her apartment the day that The Times article came out. I wanted to give her another chance to tell her side of the story. I felt like it was important for her. She, obviously, told me she would tell me her story one day but not that day, and she never did.

And you have to understand, it wasn't easy for us to shift focus. Even though we knew that she wasn't the person that she said she was, that didn't change our attachment to her. I felt bad for her. I felt - we were always trying to protect her. And here, the house of cards had already fallen, and we were still - some of us still tried to protect her.

RAZ: How do you either of you explain this? Why did she do it?

FISHER: As soon as I started talking to Angelo about this story, I thought one of the most amazing and interesting things about this story was that she never took any money. And, in fact, she gave money to the Survivors' Network. And it was clear to me right away that she did it for the attention, for some crazy need to be a star. And that's what she wanted to be, and she became that.

RAZ: That's Robin Gaby Fisher together with Angelo Guglielmo. They wrote the new book called "The Woman Who Wasn't There." It's about one of the most famous cases of identity fraud to have come out of September 11th. Angelo, Robin, thank you so much.

GUGLIELMO: Thank you so much.

FISHER: Thank you. It's been a pleasure, Guy. Thank you.

GUGLIELMO: Absolutely.

2) Literary theft NATHAN ENGLANDER?

The Talented Thief: Nathan Englander

Great Example of Literary Theft: The short story "What We Talk About When We Talk About Anne Frank." The story was originally published in [The New Yorker](#) and was included in [The Best American Short Stories 2012](#), edited by Tom Perrotta.

The Talented Victim and the Pilfered Work: Raymond Carver and his short story "What We Talk About When We Talk About Love"

Discussion:

Nathan Englander's short story "What We Talk About When We Talk About Anne Frank" describes an evening shared by two couples. Debbie and the first-person narrator are secular Jews living in Florida. Mark and Lauren (aka Yarucham and Shoshanna) are Hasidim, visiting from Israel. At first, the narrator doesn't particularly care for the guests—so his wife was Shoshanna's schoolmate twenty years earlier...big deal—but likes them much more after a few drinks and a little marijuana. The story ends as the couple plays the "Anne Frank Game" in which the Jews discuss who would or would not hide and protect them in the face of another Holocaust.

Englander is, like all great writers, an admitted thief. In his note regarding the conception of the story, he admits that he was thinking about the classic Raymond Carver story "What We Talk About When We Talk About Love." The title is an homage, and one that most literary folks would recognize. Carver's story is an alcohol-soaked discussion between two couples, just like Englander's. Both stories end with a discordant tone, as though all of the characters have understood something dark and sad about the world and themselves. What does Englander get by borrowing the title? The connection to an all-time great story brings forth great expectation from the reader, but also inspires (at least in readers like me) great admiration. After all, it takes a lot of guts to willingly put yourself in conversation with a writer like Raymond Carver.

Englander also admits that he stole the idea for the "Anne Frank Game" from his own life. He and his sister have been playing it "forever." As the author points out, the game is both sad and comforting...what must it be like to doubt that a friend would try to save your life. We all have these kinds of personal details and we must have the courage to plumb our psychological depths for these gifts. Nonfiction writers steal from their own lives in explicit ways; we all know the things that Tim O'Brien carried while he was in Vietnam. Fiction writers steal ideas and cloak them in a shield of make-believe.

What Can We Steal?

- **Appropriate titles and situations from other great works.** Yes, yes; you have to make your work your own. But when you steal a title or a famous line, you're inviting the reader to compare your piece to the classic in question. The reader will bring his or her knowledge of the original piece...and this can be a positive or a negative for you. (I don't know about you, but I'm intimidated by being compared to the greatest writers ever.)
- **Borrow from the toolboxes owned by writers in other genres.** When writing fiction, feel free to use techniques commonly used by poets. When you're writing a screenplay, think about the way a nonfiction writer condensed his or her story in a fortuitous manner. At the moment, I'm thinking of the film made from Tom Perrotta's novel Little Children. It's not odd for a film to have a narrator, but the narration in the film goes much further than most narrators, becoming a character in the same way that the narrator is a character in a novel.

3) The plagiarism Spectrum – What kind of plagiarism do we find in these examples?

Original	Unoriginal
<p>A Natural Setting</p> <p><i>A History of Exploration and Settlement in Yosemite Valley</i></p> <p>Since its first discovery by non-indigenous people in the mid-nineteenth century, Yosemite Valley has held a special, even religious, hold on the American conscience because its beauty makes it an incomparable valley and one of the grandest of all special temples of Nature. While Yosemite holds a special grip on the western mind, perceptions about the Valley have evolved over time due to changing politics, migration patterns and environmental concerns as man has become more attuned to his relationship and impact on nature.</p>	<p>A Natural Setting</p> <p><i>A History of Exploration and Settlement in Yosemite Valley</i></p> <p>Since its first discovery by non-indigenous people in the mid-nineteenth century, Yosemite Valley has held a special, even religious, hold on the American conscience because its beauty makes it an incomparable valley and one of the grandest of all special temples of Nature. While Yosemite holds a special grip on the western mind, perceptions about the Valley have evolved over time due to changing politics, migration patterns and environmental concerns as man has become more attuned to his relationship and impact on nature.</p>
<p>A Natural Setting</p> <p><i>A History of Exploration and Settlement in Yosemite Valley</i></p> <p>Since its first discovery by non-indigenous people in the mid-nineteenth century, Yosemite Valley has held a special, even religious, hold on the American conscience because its beauty makes it an incomparable valley and one of the grandest of all special temples of Nature. While Yosemite holds a special grip on the western mind, perceptions about the Valley have evolved over time due to changing politics, migration patterns and environmental concerns as man has become more attuned to his relationship and impact on nature.</p>	<p>A Beautiful Setting in Yosemite</p> <p>Since its first discovery by non-native people in the mid-19th century Yosemite Valley has held a special, even sacred, hold on the American psyche because its beauty makes it an incomparable valley and one of the grandest of all special temples of Nature. While Yosemite holds a special grip on the western mindset, perceptions about the Valley have evolved over time due to changing political movements, migration patterns and environmental issues as man has become more attuned to their relationship and impact on nature.</p>

A Natural Setting

A History of Exploration and Settlement in Yosemite Valley

Since its first discovery by non-indigenous people in the mid-nineteenth century, Yosemite Valley has held a special, even religious, hold on the American conscience because its beauty makes it an incomparable valley and one of the grandest of all special temples of Nature. While Yosemite holds a special grip on the western mind, perceptions about the Valley have evolved over time due to changing politics, migration patterns and environmental concerns as man has become more attuned to his relationship and impact on nature.

An Untouched View

A History of Settlement and Change in Yosemite Valley

The first non-natives to see Yosemite Valley were probably members of the mid-nineteenth century Joseph Walker Party, who crossed the Sierra Nevada from East to West. The first descriptions of Yosemite came almost 20 years later. From the start, the valley has been renowned for its natural beauty, and highly regarded as the centerpiece of Yosemite National Park, attracting visitors from around the world. While Yosemite holds a special grip on the western mind, perceptions about the Valley have evolved over time due to changing politics, migration patterns and environmental concerns as man has become more attuned to their relationship and impact on nature.

A Natural Setting

A History of Exploration and Settlement in Yosemite Valley

Since its first discovery by non-indigenous people in the mid-nineteenth century, Yosemite Valley has held a special, even religious, hold on the American conscience because its beauty makes it an incomparable valley and one of the grandest of all special temples of Nature. While Yosemite holds a special grip on the western mind, perceptions about the Valley have evolved over time due to changing politics, migration patterns and environmental concerns as man has become more attuned to his relationship and impact on nature.

The Beautiful Yosemite Valley

From the time of its first discovery by non-indigenous people in the mid-nineteenth century Yosemite Valley has held a special, even religious, possession on the American conscience because its beauty makes it an incomparable valley and one of the grandest of all special temples of Nature. And Yosemite holds a special grip on the western mind, while perceptions about the Valley have evolved over time due to changing politics, migration patterns and environmental concerns as man has become more attuned to his relationship and impact on nature.

A Natural Setting

A History of Exploration and Settlement in Yosemite Valley

Since its first discovery by non-indigenous people in the mid-nineteenth century, Yosemite Valley has held a special, even religious, hold on the American conscience because its beauty makes it an incomparable valley and one of the grandest of all special temples of Nature. While Yosemite holds a special grip on the western mind, perceptions about the Valley have evolved over time due to changing politics, migration patterns and environmental concerns as man has become more attuned to his relationship and impact on nature.

A History of Exploration and Settlement in Yosemite Valley

From its earliest discovery by non-indigenous people in the mid-nineteenth century Yosemite Valley has held a spiritual hold on the American conscience; its beauty is incomparable and has been held up as one of the grandest of all special temples of Nature. While Yosemite has a special grip on the western mind, impressions about the Valley have evolved over time, shaped by changing politics, migration patterns and environmental concerns as mankind has become more attuned to its relationship and impact on nature.¹

¹ Harrick, C. "A Natural Setting." *Nature and its Discontents* 23.1 (1996) : 41-50. Print.

A Natural Setting

A History of Exploration and Settlement in Yosemite Valley

Since its first discovery by non-indigenous people in the mid-nineteenth century, Yosemite Valley has held a special, even religious, hold on the American conscience because its beauty makes it an incomparable valley and one of the grandest of all special temples of Nature. While Yosemite holds a special grip on the western mind, perceptions about the Valley have evolved over time due to changing politics, migration patterns and environmental concerns as man has become more attuned to his relationship and impact on nature.

A Natural Setting

*A History of Exploration and Settlement in Yosemite Valley*¹

Yosemite Valley was first sighted by non-Indians in 1833 by Joseph Rutherford Walker and his group of explorers.² Yosemite has a long and diverse cultural history that helped to shape the region, country, and even the world.³ While Yosemite holds a special grip on the western mind, perceptions about the Valley have evolved over time due to changing politics, migration patterns and environmental concerns as man has become more attuned to their relationship and impact on nature.⁴

¹ Harrick, C. "A Natural Setting." *Nature and its Discontents* 23.1 (1996) : 41-50. Print.

² "History of Yosemite," *Yosemitegold.com Ace & Friends*, n.d. Web. 24 Apr. 2012. <<http://www.yosemitegold.com/yosemite/history.html>>

³ "Yosemite National Park Cultural History," *Yosemitepark.com DNC Parks and Resorts at Yosemite, Inc.*, n.d. Web. 24 Apr. 2012. <<http://www.yosemitepark.com/cultural-history.aspx>>

⁴ Harrick, C. "A Natural Setting," p. 41.

A Natural Setting

A History of Exploration and Settlement in Yosemite Valley

Since its first discovery by non-indigenous people in the mid-nineteenth century, Yosemite Valley has held a special, even religious, hold on the American conscience because its beauty makes it an incomparable valley and one of the grandest of all special temples of Nature. While Yosemite holds a special grip on the western mind, perceptions about the Valley have evolved over time due to changing politics, migration patterns and environmental concerns as man has become more attuned to his relationship and impact on nature.

Perceived Beauty: Man's Nature

Exploration and Settlement in Yosemite Valley

"Since its first discovery by the Joseph Walker Party in the mid-nineteenth century"¹ "Yosemite Valley has held a special, even religious, hold on the American conscience because its beauty makes it an incomparable valley and one of the grandest of all "special temples of Nature."² "While Yosemite holds a special grip on the western mind, perceptions about the Valley have evolved over time due to changing politics, migration patterns and environmental concerns as man has become more attuned to their relationship and impact on nature."³

¹ For an insightful discussion of Walker's expedition, including an extended description of their first sight of Yosemite Valley, see Walker's original piece in *The Golden Times*. May 5, 1833 : p. 4. Print.

² Bloom, H. "Aesthetics of the Found: The 'Nature' of the Natural." *Aesthetics and the Found*. November 2000 : 18-22. Print.

³ Huang et al. "Politics, Policy, and the Environment." *Nature and Society*. 25.3 (1997) : 127-53. Print.

A Natural Setting

A History of Exploration and Settlement in Yosemite Valley

Since its first discovery by non-indigenous people in the mid-nineteenth century, Yosemite Valley has held a special, even religious, hold on the American conscience because its beauty makes it an incomparable valley and one of the grandest of all special temples of Nature. While Yosemite holds a special grip on the western mind, perceptions about the Valley have evolved over time due to changing politics, migration patterns and environmental concerns as man has become more attuned to his relationship and impact on nature.

A Natural Setting

A History of Exploration and Settlement in Yosemite Valley

Since its first discovery by non-indigenous people in the mid-nineteenth century Yosemite Valley has held a special, even religious, hold on the American conscience. The work of Ayres gave easterners an appreciation for Yosemite Valley and started a movement to preserve it. While Yosemite holds a special grip on the western mind, perceptions about the Valley have evolved over time due to changing politics, migration patterns and environmental concerns as man has become more attuned to their relationship and impact on nature. The 1849 California Gold Rush led to conflicts between miners and natives, and the volunteer Mariposa Battalion was formed by the state of California as a punitive expedition against natives in the Yosemite area.

A Natural Setting

A History of Exploration and Settlement in Yosemite Valley

Since its first discovery by non-indigenous people in the mid-nineteenth century, Yosemite Valley has held a special, even religious, hold on the American conscience because its beauty makes it an incomparable valley and one of the grandest of all special temples of Nature. While Yosemite holds a special grip on the western mind, perceptions about the Valley have evolved over time due to changing politics, migration patterns and environmental concerns as man has become more attuned to his relationship and impact on nature.

Ecology 201:

An Unnatural Expectation

The Impact of Exploration and Settlement in Yosemite Valley

From its first discovery by the Ahwahnechee in the mid-nineteenth century Yosemite Valley has held a unique, even religious, hold on the American conscience because its beauty makes it an incomparable valley and one of the grandest of all special temples of Nature. While Yosemite holds a special grip on the western mind, perceptions about the Valley have evolved over time reflecting changing politics, human migration patterns and the rise of environmental concerns as man has become more attuned to his relationship and impact on nature.

A Natural Setting

A History of Exploration and Settlement in Yosemite Valley

Since its first discovery by non-indigenous people in the mid-nineteenth century, Yosemite Valley has held a special, even religious, hold on the American conscience because its beauty makes it an incomparable valley and one of the grandest of all special temples of Nature. While Yosemite holds a special grip on the western mind, perceptions about the Valley have evolved over time due to changing politics, migration patterns and environmental concerns as man has become more attuned to his relationship and impact on nature.

A Natural Setting

A History of Exploration and Settlement in Yosemite Valley

Since its first discovery by non-indigenous people in the mid-nineteenth century, Yosemite Valley has held a special, even religious, hold on the American conscience because its beauty makes it an incomparable valley and one of the grandest of all special temples of Nature. "Native Americans have lived in the Yosemite region for as long as 8,000 years. The first people that we have record of was a band of Native Americans that called the Valley "Ah-wah-nee" and themselves the Ahwahnechee."¹ While Yosemite holds a special grip on the western mind, perceptions about the Valley have evolved over time due to changing politics, migration patterns and environmental concerns as man has become more attuned to his relationship and impact on nature.

¹ "Yosemite Valley." Wikipedia. Wikipedia. 20 Apr. 2012. <http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Yosemite_Valley>

A Natural Setting

A History of Exploration and Settlement in Yosemite Valley

Since its first discovery by non-indigenous people in the mid-nineteenth century, Yosemite Valley has held a special, even religious, hold on the American conscience because its beauty makes it an incomparable valley and one of the grandest of all special temples of Nature. While Yosemite holds a special grip on the western mind, perceptions about the Valley have evolved over time due to changing politics, migration patterns and environmental concerns as man has become more attuned to his relationship and impact on nature.

A Beautiful Setting in Yosemite

Since its first discovery by non-native people in the mid-19th century Yosemite Valley has held a special, even sacred, hold on the American psyche because its beauty makes it an incomparable valley and one of the grandest of all special temples of Nature. While Yosemite holds a special grip on the western mindset, perceptions about the Valley have evolved over time due to changing political movements, migration patterns and environmental issues as man has become more attuned to their relationship and impact on nature.